Teleconference

Page 1

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

FOR THE DISTRICT OF DELAWARE

Ì

)

)

Civil Action No.

05-441-JJF

ADVANCED MICRO DEVICES,

Plaintiffs,

v.

INTEL CORPORATION,

Defendant.

Teleconference in above matter taken pursuant to notice before Renee A. Meyers, Registered Professional Reporter and Notary Public, in the offices of Blank Rome, LLP, 1201 North Market Street, Wilmington, Delaware, on Friday, February 8, 2008, beginning at approximately 2:00 p.m., there being present:

BEFORE:

THE HONOROABLE VINCENT J. POPPITI, SPECIAL MASTER APPEARANCES:

O'MELVENY & MYERS JAMES PEARL, ESQ. MARK SAMUELS, ESQ. JENNIFER CHANG, ESQ. 1999 Avenue of the Stars Los Angeles, California 90067 for AMD BETH OSMOND, In-house AMD Counsel

CORBETT & WILCOX Registered Professional Reporters 230 North Market Street Wilmington, DE 19899 (302) 571-0510 www.corbettreporting.com Corbett & Wilcox is not affiliated With Wilcox & Fetzer, Court Reporters

Teleconference

Page 2	
1	APPEARANCES (Continued):
2	RICHARDS, LAYTON & FINGER FREDERICK L. COTTRELL, III, ESQ.
3	One Rodney Square Wilmington, DE 19899 for AMD
5	POTTER, ANDERSON & CORROON
6	RICHARD L. HORWITZ, ESQ. 1313 North Market Street, 6th Floor
7	Wilmington, DE 19899 for Intel
8	GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER, LLP ROBERT COOPER, ESQ.
9	ROBERT COOPER, ESQ. DANIEL FLOYD, ESQ. KAY KOCHENDERFER, ESQ. RICHARD LEVY, ESQ. JOSHUA STOKES, ESQ.
10	
11	333 South Grand Avenue Los Angeles, California 90071-3197
12	for Intel
13	PRICKETT, JONES & ELLIOTT JAMES L. HOLZMAN, ESQ.
14	1310 King Street Wilmington, DE 19801
15	for Class
16	COHEN, MILSTEIN, HAUSFELD & TOLL, P.L.L.C. MICHAEL LEHMANN, ESQ.
17 18	1100 New York Avenue, N.W Suite 500, West Tower
	Washington, D.C. 20005 for Class
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
1	

(·

	Page 3
1	SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: Let's go back
2	to the beginning and start with Fred, please.
3	MR. COTTRELL: Yes, Your Honor. In
4	Wilmington, for AMD, Fred Cottrell, and I will let
5	Mr. Samuels at O'Melveny introduce everybody with him.
6	SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: Thanks,
7	Mr. Cottrell.
8	MR. SAMUELS: Yes. Mark Samuels here
9	with O'Melveny & Myers, and on the line with me are Bo
10	Pearl, excuse me, James Pearl, and Jennifer Chang, and,
11	as well, Beth Osmond from AMD.
12	SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: Thank you very
13	much.
14	MR. HOLZMAN: For the Class, James
15	Holzman, Prickett, Jones, Wilmington.
16	SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: Thank you.
17	(Discussion off the record.)
18	SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: Has everyone
19	identified themselves, please?
20	MR. HORWITZ: Jim, is anyone else on for
21	the Class with you?
22	MR. HOLZMAN: I haven't heard anyone,
23	Rich. I understand Mike Lehmann of the Cohen, Milstein
24	firm was going to join us, and if he is not on, I think

Page 4 we can go forward anyway. I will try to send him a note. 1 Judge, for Intel, it's MR. HORWITZ: 2 Rich Horwitz, Potter, Anderson in Wilmington, and I will 3 let the other folks introduce themselves again. 4 5 SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: Thanks again. (Discussion off the record.) 6 SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: The reason for 7 8 the call today is I can report to everyone that absent 9 some answers to some questions that I think are going to be important for me to pose and absent any other 10 production on my in camera review, I am at least finished 11 the review. That does not mean that I am ready to say, 12 No. 1, the documents are to be produced. Obviously, 13 14 there is something else, in terms of a decision, that I 15 have to offer with respect to that. I would expect that the documents should 16 be ready for purposes of my saying they are complete and 17 ready for production, if production is appropriate, 18 sometime toward the end of next week. 19 20 My somewhat of a dilemma, and I have to do it rather generically because everyone is 21 participating on the call, there are some questions that 22 23 I believe will be important for me to pose to Intel for the purpose of determining whether, in fact, I have 24

Page 5 completeness, and without saying more, I want you to at 1 least assist me with coming up with some mechanism to do 2 that. 3 And my expectation is that once we work 4 out that mechanism, that teleconference, and I think it 5 should be in the form of a teleconference unless there is 6 a suggestion otherwise, is likely to take maybe a half 7 hour at most, maybe 45 minutes. The reason why I think 8 9 it's important to do that --MR. LEHMANN: Hi, it's Mike Lehmann. 10 Sorry I am late. 11 12 SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: Thank you, sir. The reason why I think it's important to 13 do that before actually sitting down with everyone in the 14same room and having me, if you will, point and click to 15 Intel in terms of what my colorations are to the 16 production that has been provided to me, I think I need 17 to have that conversation for purposes of either saying, 18 Okay, in light of your answer, I need the following, or, 19. 20 Okay, in light of your answers, I am satisfied that what I have is complete and I understand everything that is on 21 these pages for purposes of making a judgment that there 22 should be production or there shouldn't be production and 23 the reasons for same. 24

Page 6 Now, that's kind of where I am. And I 1 am not sure that I can be, and I have given some thought 2 to this, I don't think I can be anymore particular than 3 that without discussing what my issues are in front of 4 everyone. 5 The conversation that I propose that I 6 have with Intel, I think it would be appropriate for that 7 conversation to be recorded -- by "recorded," I mean we 8 have a court reporter -- for that transcript to be 9 sealed, and it would only be used in a case where there 10 is some challenge to the process, if you will, so that 11 Judge Farnan, if called upon, would have complete 12 understanding as to what I have done. 13 MR. COOPER: Your Honor, this is Bob 14 15 Cooper. That procedure is certainly in line with what, over the past years, I have found have been -- has been 16 done by a Special Master or a Court when they have been 17 looking at documents in camera, and it seems entirely 18 appropriate to me. The way it would be held would be a 19 meeting between you and representatives of Intel which 20 would then be recorded but maintained in confidence for 21 22 the time being. 23 Now, I should add one thing. We have 24 committed to get back to you this week with respect to

1.

Page 7 whether or not there were additional documents. 1 2 SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: Yes, you did, indeed, and I was going to ask that question. 3 MR. COOPER: We have found some. Т 4 should let someone else describe them here, but it's not 5 6 anything substantial, but, nevertheless, you should be aware of it. 7 SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: Okay. 8 9 MR. LEVY: Your Honor, this is Richard 10 Levy. SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: Mr. Levy, 11 12 please. 13 MR. LEVY: I am a bit sheepish in saying 14 this only because I had really hoped that at the end of 15last week, we had received all of the documents. In fact, we received about an inch worth of additional 16 documents that we have been furiously color coding to get 17 to you and get out the door today and will plan on 18 delivering it to you this evening. 19 20 SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: That's fine. MR. LEVY: And it is our understanding 21 that with an exception that I am going to tell you about 22 in a second, that will be all the documents we will 23 24 produce.

Page 8	
1	I don't know if we will produce any
2	additional, but my understanding is that there happened
3	to have been an interview of two custodians this last
4	week, and I am not sure whether anything has been put to
5	paper or any or there has been any summary. I don't
6	even know whether we need to submit anything.
7	But absent that, I have been assured
8	that there are no further documents, and, as I said, I
9	regret that I haven't known that beforehand and I regret
10	that I am going to have to supply that to you later than
11	I thought.
12	SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: And I
13	understand, I appreciate your candor, and there is no
14	need for your regret. I look forward to receiving
15	whatever you have.
16	I would suggest this: If they are going
17	to be coming, obviously, they are going to be coming from
18	Mr. Horwitz's office, our doors, for purposes of
19	accepting mail after hours, close, they close at around
20	5:30, and my concern is I don't want the production to be
21	dumped into an overnight box that I am going to have some
22	difficulty getting into.
23	MR. LEVY: I am hopeful that it's going
24	to be during the course of business on Monday.

ĺ.

	Page 9
1	SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: I am sorry.
2	MR. LEVY: We are going to mail them
3	tonight and hopefully deliver them to you in the morning
4	or sometime Monday.
5	SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: That's fine.
6	That's fine. I misunderstood what you said. Monday is
7	fine.
8	MR. LEVY: Thank you, Your Honor.
9	SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: With that, may
10	I hear from AMD and from the Class regarding my proposal
11	to have a transcribed teleconference? And I do think
12	that it will work for a teleconference. I don't think I
13	need to have someone here live because even if even if
14	it's important for me to identify a page, if you will,
15	out of all the bates pages that you have provided,
16	whoever will be on the other end of the line, I would
17	expect, would have the availability of that page or those
18	pages in front of them.
19	I am not sure that it's important for me
20	to have someone here live. I don't want to create that
21	inconvenience, if you will, unless someone thinks it's
22	important to do it that way.
23	MR. SAMUELS: It's Mark Samuels.
24	Certainly the procedure that you have outlined is
	to have someone here live. I don't want to create that inconvenience, if you will, unless someone thinks it's important to do it that way. MR. SAMUELS: It's Mark Samuels. Certainly the procedure that you have outlined is
NAMES AND ADDRESS OF ADDRESS	

www.corbettreporting.com

Page 10 agreeable to us. I assume that the teleconference would 1 be with counsel for Intel rather than individual 2 witnesses for Intel; am I understanding that correctly? 3 SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: That's what I 4 envision. It may be that I would ask a question that 5 could result in an answer saying, We are going to have to 6 check that and get back with you. But, yes, I do not 7 want to be dealing with any witnesses, if you will. 8 MR. SAMUELS: Very well, Your Honor. So 9 that's fine with us. 10One other point -- "fine with us," 11 meaning AMD. I don't want to speak for Class. 12 There is one other item I did want to 13 raise, though. Mr. Levy indicated that there are more 14 materials yet to be provided to Your Honor. One thing we 15 were expecting upon the completion of the production are 16 representations in writing that the production to Your 17 Honor has been -- is complete and that no materials are 18being withheld that contain factual information that is 19 not contained in the materials that have been provided to 20 you, and I assume there is no controversy about that, but 21 I didn't want that to get lost in the shuffle here. 22 SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: I am glad you 23 posed the, at least offered the issue. Mr. Levy, will 24

Page 11 1 that document be provided at the same time that these documents will be provided on Monday, or are you 2 3 expecting that it's important to wait a brief period of 4 time before you do that? MR. LEVY: Your Honor, we planned on 5 doing it at the same time. As I told you at -- the only 6 7 hiccup I have with regard to that are these two new interviews and I haven't figured out whether, in fact, we 8 are submitting anything. So absent that, we are 9 10 anticipating that it will be part of a letter that will get to you sometime on Monday, and as we have done 11 before, there will be a copy of that letter that will go 12 to Mr. Samuels and his office. 13 14 SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: Okay. Well, 15 you have identified that there were interviews, so the 16 record is certainly protected with respect to that. If 17 there is any production that has to be provided either pursuant to paragraph eight, then I am confident that you 18 19will do that, and if there is any further production to me for in camera purposes, it will happen, I am just 20 going to say it should happen as soon as it can. I think 21 22 that's the appropriate way to do that. 23 MR. LEVY: Thank you, Your Honor. 24SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: And my

Page 12 question, since everyone is on the line, if you will give 1 2 me one moment, please. 3 MR. LEHMANN: I should add, Your Honor, 4 Michael Lehmann on behalf of the Class plaintiffs, that we are fine with your proposed procedure as well. 5 SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: I am sorry. I 6 7 checked the box too quickly. Thank you, sir. Just one moment. 8 Counsel, I have anticipated that the 9 10 review would, in fact, take through next week, and I am certainly pleased that it hasn't, so I am available 11 virtually any time next week after Monday. I could do it 12 Monday afternoon after four. 13 14 MR. COOPER: Your Honor, why don't we 15 schedule it a little bit later so you will have had the 16 benefit of the documents we are forwarding. 17 SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: That's fine. And if we want to do, how does the 13th, any time in the 18 19 afternoon, work? MR. LEHMANN: That's fine on behalf of 20 21 Class plaintiffs. MR. SAMUELS: I assume this would be a 22 call just with Intel counsel? 23 24 SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: That's correct.

Page 13 I am really looking only to Intel's calendar, but I 1 2 certainly want everyone to be advised when I set this. 3 Are you all there? MR. LEVY: I thought I had asked what 4 time you would like to do it. 5 SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: I am sorry. 6 MR. LEVY: The 13th in the afternoon is 7 fine by us. Just give us a time. 8 9 SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: Why don't we do it at 1:00. 10 11 MR. HORWITZ: Your Honor, if 1:00 works for everyone else, then I will get someone else to 12 13 participate here. 14 SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: I can do it 15 later. 16 MR. HORWITZ: Could we do it at 3:00 our time? 17 18 SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: We can. 19 MR. HORWITZ: Does that work out in California? 20 MR. LEVY: That will be fine. 21 SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: Then let's set 22 it for 3:00 p.m., and, Renee, please, we want you to be 23 24 taking the transcript for that, but it is one that will

Page 14 not be, it will not be filed and it would not be made available to anyone other than Mr. Horwitz, and, of course, to me. L Any other questions, please, or comments? MR. LEVY: None here, Your Honor. MR. SAMUELS: None from AMD, Your Honor. SPECIAL MASTER POPPITI: Thank you all for your time. (The teleconference was concluded at 2:19 p.m.)

Page 15] CERTIFICATE STATE OF DELAWARE: 2 NEW CASTLE COUNTY: 3 I, Renee A. Meyers, a Registered Professional 4 Reporter, within and for the County and State aforesaid, 5 6 do hereby certify that the foregoing teleconference was 7 taken before me, pursuant to notice, at the time and place indicated; that the teleconference was correctly 8 9 recorded in machine shorthand by me and thereafter 10 transcribed under my supervision with computer-aided transcription; that the foregoing teleconference is a 11 true record; and that I am neither of counsel nor kin to 12 13 any party in said action, nor interested in the outcome 14 thereof. WITNESS my hand this 8th day of February A.D. 1516 2008. 17 18 19 Α. MEYERS REGISTERED PROFESSIONAL REPORTER 20 CERTIFICATION NO. 106-RPR (Expires January 31, 2011) 21 22 23 24